



Equitable Estates and Management Policy (Analysis of the Benefit and the Primary side, Product marketing Palm oil plantation in Riau Province)

Pazli S¹ and IP. MSi²

¹University of Riau, INDONESIA

²University of Andalas Padang, INDONESIA

Available online at: www.isca.in, www.isca.me

Received 24th March 2015, revised 8th June 2015, accepted 15th June 2015

Abstract

The research about the development of equitable estates namely "how the realities of development policy and management aspects of the expediency of plantation and marketing the main production, the production of oil palm plantations on the sideline Riau Province?", has indeed not fair or equitable to plantation companies, State companies and private people's estates (the subject of the estate)?. What are the implications of these policies and how rekonstruksinya?. Using analysis of inequities among others; aspects of marginalization; aspects of monopoly; aspects of domination. The data collected from the relevant documents, the estate of the subject on the existing development pattern 5. The results of research on policy and management plan of the estate there is no provision governing the distribution of primary production and marketing expediency, sideline production and plantation estates subject to all. On the implementation of the policy has memarginalisasikan, monopolize and dominate people's peasant farmers and not the plasma plasma plantations, have implications for the strengthening of marginalization, the existence of a monopoly and dominance of State/private plantation companies, ignoring people's contribution as plasma plantation farmers (partnership), terpentalnya farmers self help from welfare. Reconstruction of a plantation development policy that is equitable; the reduction of the Power of domination; Strengthening economic democracy towards monopoly; strengthening of the rights of a subject/estate against marginalization and; strengthening of the obligations of Government to the prosperity and well-being of people's estates.

Keywords: Management, agricultural policies, equitable estates.

Introduction

This paper is about policy development and management of plantations which reveal the occurrence of interaction between a subject of plantations (country estates company, plantation companies are private and people) on some of the patterns of development of plantations, among others; the pattern of Pure business-use rights; the pattern of use rights business-Folk-Core Plasma plantations, Transmigration; the pattern of use rights Efforts of folk-Core Plasma Plantation Cooperative ownership of Primary members; the pattern of Populist economic empowerment and Self-help, which alleged a pattern of not equitable in the segment of management policy and implementation plan of the main production and marketing expediency such as Crude Palm Oil (CPO) and sideline production of palm oil processing factories, among others; high acid, palm kernel, shells, fibers, dirty oil.

The significance of research in terms of thinking substance, among others, namely: i. for development policy and management subtansial estate on benefit aspects, main production and marketing results sideline estates in favour to the company and the company's country estates of private estates as the core; ii. the implementation of policies and management on aspects of the benefit, the main production and marketing results sideline plantations more contributed significantly to the State,

the company and the company's country estates of private plantations, compared to the people who also served as the subject of palm oil plantations. This condition is seen as an injustice between the subject of plantations in particular on aspects of production and marketing expediency of plantations. Previous studies of the development policy of plantations by large companies both private companies and State companies as Soetrisno¹ which explains that the pattern of development that put the company's plantation estates private plantation companies and the State as a party to the core and the people as a satellite has a mission as a means of equitable development, as well as having evidence for macro, among others; i. implementation of reforma agraria ii. the little people's inaccessibility, iii. a vast area of inaccessibility. Research of Arif², that since the colonial times until the present Netherlands dialectic relationship of local economies and large estates in North Sumatra in the context of people's emancipation of the lower classes, it does not indicate a positive and meaningful role; Change management leadership of Netherlands to the indigenous management (government) does not change the character of the relations between economic actors in that relationship especially between actors who have economic power with the weak economy; The economy remains on the lectics relationships Netherlands Government management at the time of colonization and indigenous government management at the time of independence. Gunawan et al³

suggests the dynamics that occur in program implementation PIR-Bun and dilemmas that occur in the plasma farmers project PIR-Bun coconut Hybrids in Cisokan. According to them: a pattern of project PIR-Bun became a farmer that bureaucratic because many authorities who intervened; the assumption that became the cornerstone of the development of this project turns out in practice is not appropriate: (a) Assuming the project can increase the peasants income of PIR plasma and population, the reality is just the opposite, farmer welfare degraded by plasma trend suffered a process of impoverishment in three dimensions.

Chotim⁴ do your research people's Core food Plantation on agro-industries Pineapples in Subang, saw business linkages between the plasma farmers and processing industry Pineapple. This research suggests that the normative goals expected from the development of PEAR food failed to achieve. Farmer's objection to be bound in a contract and the occurrence of conflict is an inefficient provision between the rights and obligations of the stake holders. Fadjar⁵, research on changes in the structure of the incomplete in partnership business estates, according to fadjar construction sub-sectors of plantations in Indonesia aimed at achieving growth and equity. However, this is not easy because it would be dealing with the question of colonial latent, that inequality among large plantations and plantation. Wahyuni⁶, conducted a study on the construction of people's economy on a plantation in West Sumatera, the empirical basis of this research found that; The construction of estates not yet fully reflect the concept of the construction of people's economy, even though most farmers Plantation development project participants of folk-Core Credit Primary Ownership and Resettlement of members has been able to pay off their credit.

In contrast to some previous ideas and research results, on this occasion the author focuses on policy development and management of plantations on the expediency of the main production and marketing, production of the estate subject to the plantations side, to understand how aspect and sub aspects of the even elements of the benefit aspect of the main production and marketing, the production side not suspected plantations that have implications for the fairness to the subject of the estate so that it could formulate equitable estates development management construction in Riau Province. The main question in this research is "how the reality of policy and management of plantations on" aspect of the main production and marketing expediency, the production side of plantation estates on the subject between Riau Province?" The next question is as follows: i. whether the right segment of the plan and the implementation of the policy and management aspects of the main production and marketing expediency, the production side of plantation "no fairness" to the subject of plantations?; ii. the extent to which the implementation of "no fairness" to the subject of plantations?; iii. how the implication and construction "no fairness" into "fairness" to the subject of plantations on a segment of the plan and its implementation?.

Based on these questions, this paper intends to: i. identify the

reality of the facts of injustice on the policy and management aspects of the main production and marketing expediency and sideline production plantations that are planned to be implemented. ii. Identify the factors determining the size of the element and injustice on a segment of the implementation aspects of the expediency of the main production and marketing, the production side of plantation; iii. Find the implications and construction plans and the implementation of the policy and management aspects of the primary product and marketing expediency, the plantation was not a side "fairness" into "fairness" to the third estate that is subject of the company's country estate, a private plantation companies and the people.

Policy and management (production and marketing expediency of aspects of primary, secondary production of plantation): Policy of the estate started in the late 1970s, following the recommendation of the World Bank to build plantations in Indonesia, realized in the form of large plantations and plantation between 1970-1980. Assessment of the implementation of the policies and management of plantations polarized into two poles. The first polar argues that the plantation sector of the country, the private sector contribute to the economy of the country. On the other pole looked at the plantation sector does not contribute to the economy of the nation. The criticism against the then government of doing repairs on two aspects; The first improvements to the policy and management of plantations which involve local communities in the development of plantations, among others, namely: i. Increase in joint production, ii. the improvement of the estate facilities, iii. infrastructure supporting production of agriculture⁷; The two do three development patterns namely: i. the core of people's Estates, large plantation companies business partnership as the core, and the farmer as a plasma, ii. a pattern of community based organizations i.e. gardens built and get coaching and guidance from the Government, estate development programme partnership through a pattern of PIR-based Resettlement to Presidential Decree No. 1/1986, whereas the pattern of Primary Ownership Cooperative Members was based on a joint decision of the Minister of agriculture and Minister of cooperatives and Small Entrepreneurs Coaching No. 73/Kpts/KB. 51.0/2/1998 and no. 01/LCS/M/11/1998. Fredman and Karen⁸ says that the type of relationship the integration that is promising in the estate is the relationship between satellite farming around the corporate core i.e. farmers as a satellite to the company's agro-industries as the core. This system is a new concept for correcting large plantation system weaknesses at once answered the question of the social development of rural economy as a whole. This relationship forms here in after referred to farmer contract (contract farming) formulated Kirk.

The naming model contract farming is different in many countries, for example those developed for plantations in Indonesia translated into the form of a system of core company people, and internationally known Nucleus Estate and Smallholders System. The company's core is a plantation partnership pattern was first introduced and developed into the core Company's Pattern of transmigration (PIR-Trans). Further

refinement of the Government doing with developing patterns of palm oil plantations as stated in the decision letter of the Minister of forestry and Plantations No. 107/Kpts-II/1999, with the aim to increase production and mensejahterahkan the life of farmers⁹. He views it as the best solution partnership to build a relationship of mutual harmonization profitable, especially among the plantation with the surrounding community¹⁰.

Experience from many countries who run kontrak farming shows that farmers are thus more disadvantaged, because farmers have lost control of the production results, marketing as well as the means of production¹¹. Plus more that in a system that emphasized the existence of farming kontrak spesialisasi production so it really depends on the results of a single plant (monocultures). Farmers' dependence on a single crop has led to farmers have always faced a monocrop vulnerability¹². Patterns of partnership seen as unfavorable pattern, especially at the end of the partnership thus interfere with social life has existed, since the fact that patterns have yet to provide sustainable benefits for the community and do not build self-reliance in village community.

Methodology

This research is a combination of quantitative and qualitative research. Implemented in Riau Province. Sampling is done with purposif and multi-stage Random Sampling. The data collected are the primary and secondary data. Secondary data obtained from research reports and publications are government agencies in Riau Province. Primary data obtained through in-depth interviews of the subject development of plantations on five pattern of development estates namely: Pure Business use rights patterns; the pattern of use rights Efforts of folk-Core Plasma plantations, Transmigration; the pattern of use rights Efforts of folk-Core Plasma Plantation Cooperative ownership of Primary members; the pattern of Populist economic empowerment and Self-help pattern. The analysis uses the concept; i. marginalization, referring to Duffy's opinion ' inability to participate effectively in economic, social life, politics and culture, alienation and far from mainstream society¹³. Marginalization is measured in; in access, on the controls and on the merits; ii. the ability of the overall control of one party (the total amount/market price) compared to other parties on specific aspects of resources. Measured on a monopoly; typical resources, economies of scale, political/business policy; the dominance of the occurrence of a particular subject by the mastery of the subject anywhere else on sebagainya only as a result of such a subject does not play a role. domination is measured in; magnitut power.

Results and Discussion

There are two polar views are different in respect of policies and the management of palm oil plantations in Indonesia. Opinion that the plantation sector of the state and the private sector to contribute to the economy of the country especially on the results of the plantation production of primary production such

as Crude Palm Oil (CPO) and sideline production among other plantations; high acid, palm kernel, shells, fibers, dirty oil. As the rays of the Peasantry (Issue 22-December 28, 2010)," in line with the vast increase in acreage of export commodities, the reception estates also experienced significant increases. In 2009 only reached US \$ 31, 72 billion (or approximately 317 trillion rupiah), Crude Palm Oil export levy of more than Rp 9.2 trillion ". Before the existence of the estate to the national economy according to Frasetiandy¹⁴, serves as a particularly good labor absorption of both local and expatriate personnel; increase in gross Regional Domestic Product or supplement Budget Revenues through taxation areas of spending will have an impact in the long term to improve the condition of the economy of an area. Similarly, in the report of the ministry of agriculture, that the agricultural sector's contribution to national gross domestic product amounted to 2.31 percent, where the 10,97% of which sub sector of the estate after the sub sectors of the plant foodstuffs amounted to 6.96%. According to Hadi¹⁵ saw big plantations provide the benefit as a source of foreign exchange for non-gas, a source of employment opportunities as well as field investments for national and international investors. Previous Floering¹⁶, "the big plantations provide advantages to the country of production and value added, thus the construction of the estate contribute significantly to the income of the country through the fulfillment of domestic needs and export". While according to Kartasasmita¹⁷ "the effect of the large estates of the attitude of the population is not as expected, the people turned out to not necessarily be independent otherwise thus depends upon the company to add to the many problems in society". Likewise, according to Fadjjar¹⁸, "the people's party (plasma farming) are in the position that more acts as a complementary structure of plantation development partnerships; participation of farmers individually or through farmers' organization container in the post-harvest processing activities, determining the quality and quantity as well as marketing (transportation, pricing and payment results) is still very minimal.

According to the author, the success of the construction of the estate is certainly not merely views of how big its contribution to the economy of the country, as it is associated with the opinions of John Rawls¹⁹ stating principles of justice based on the principle of rights, not on the merits. If the basic benefit that became the basis of the fairness of the procedure ignores the fear, the thing that is considered to be the main course, the end result which has many benefits for people as possible without worrying about the ways and the procedure, otherwise the principle of justice based on the principle of the right to childbirth procedures that fear because based on the rights (individuals) that cannot be ignored.

Based on the above reasoning, there are two questions that the writer pointed out that criticism. First, whether the economic contribution from the company's plantation estates private companies State and to the economy of the country has maintained its position as a justice?. If not, how these inequities maintained its position on the plan policy and its

implementation?; Second, what are the implications and how to reconstruct the plantation management policy and justice for the third subject of the plantation in Riau Province?. Theory and concept analysis approach to justice and injustice can be used to answer the above questions.

Policy and management benefit, marketing production company results country estates, a private plantation company, on the pattern of use rights to pure effort:

The reality of the segment of the plan and the implementation of the policy of the management of the benefit and the main production and marketing results sideline production plantations have been conducted is not equitable. How the reality of injustice is happening?. There has been a marginalization on elements of access and opportunity in which people as supplier of Fresh Fruit Bunches (FFB) to the processing plant of the company's palm oil plantation country or private plantation companies (Pure Businesses use rights) were not given access to get the benefit and enjoy the value of economic production and primary production side plantations, on the sub control aspects, the company is authorized to assign economic value and added value of the primary product; Crude Palm Oil and sideline production such as; high acid, palm kernel, shells, fibers and dirty oil, further marginalization on the estate where the economic expediency of resource production and the production of the estate not to sideline the people's welfare as the contrary farmer suppliers, for the management of the company. This marginalization occurs because people do not have economical control of production and marketing expediency of coconuts over its processed palm oil processing plant. Lost the rights to the production control itself is injustice, indeed between companies or Palm oil processing plant with the people as a supplier of Coconut Fruit Palm is not required to get the benefit of the main production and marketing and the sideline is exactly the same, for the same division is not necessarily fair because it should be the same, but it's fair to describe the consistency between the input-output division. Justice seen on benefit based on contributions given each the subject of plantations. How the occurrence of monopolistic?. Monopoly happens on a typical plantation resources, namely the actions of state plantation companies and the private plantation companies monopolize the main production control; Crude Palm Oil and sideline production such as; high acid, palm kernel, shells, fibers and oil is dirty, likewise, a monopoly on the scale economy/business (market) plantations where state and private forestry company mastered production of the estate market signals full collaboration between the company and the company's country plantation estates are private. Next on the politics of policies also occur the monopoly to the people, where the country's plantation companies and the private plantation companies ruled the existing regulation since the benefit plans and marketing segment results of production such as law No 18/2004 about the plantation confirms that legal for corporations to private and state plantations purely to obtain added value through the application of the system and the effort of agribusiness plantations (Law No 18/2004 part one, article 27). Thus in such

assessment there is a plantation and management policies are not equitable, which benefits the country estates company and a private plantation companies compared to the people. This reality is relevant to the conditions of the theory of Justice that Rawls States that a general regulation is "fair" if she actually applied, while a general regulation is "unfair" if applied to a case and is not applied to other similar cases.

Policies and benefit management and marketing of the results of production between the subject of plantation, Plantation patterns of use rights the core Business-folk and Trans Plasma pattern of use rights the core Estate Business-Credit Plasma Primary Ownership Folk members:

Reality on the plan policy and management aspects of the production and marketing of the benefit subject to the pattern of existing plantations is not equitable, the indications are the unavailability of benefit policies that govern the production and marketing of primary and secondary production of plantation country estates between the company and the company's private estates (core company) and folk (plasma farming) and isolate have on access and opportunity, where a plantation form results fresh fruit bunches that come from people's gardens (the plasma farmers and peasant resettlement plasma primary ownership credit members) as a raw material for producing the main product of CPO and the production side of the kernel, shells, fibers and dirty oil cannot be accessed and feel the benefit to the welfare of the plasma farmers. Control and control of the production of the plantation management companies completely below the State or private estates as the core parties have full rights over the control of oil palm processing factories. So people as isolated from plasma farmers benefit and marketing production. This kind of practice is a form of injustice in the equitable estate development partnerships, as in the view of John Rawls justice enforcement programs that prolific populist must pay attention to two principles of Justice, namely; the first grant of rights and equal opportunities on the most extensive basic liberty of freedom is the same for everyone; Both were able to reorganize the socioeconomic gap that occurs so it can give a reciprocal advantage for everyone, both those from the Group of lucky and unlucky. The practice happens is also not showing the distribution of the benefit of a fair to subject other people i.e. plantations as farmers plasma. This condition certainly deviate from the justice distributief justice that gives to each person the magnitude part according to his achievements in which "material (goods) must be distributed to the individual based on the relative claims of each". Likewise, in view of the Dillon "everybody contributes according to fitrah, the responsibility he he, a right he and his ability"²⁰.

In addition to marginalization from the core company, also occur among other monopoly on mastery of high technology which the company and the company's country plantation estates of private practices to monopolize the ownership of production processing technology plantations. Beside that, on political policies, where the policy comes from the States tend to favour to the company's core by means of accommodating the

interests of the owners of capital (company plantation estates private companies and States) compared to political alignments policies to the people, especially on the situation and conditions in the absence of the rule of law which regulates the marketing and benefit of the results of the primary production and processing sideline production plantations.

Policy and management aspects of the benefit people's production and marketing pattern of Populist economic empowerment and Self-help Pattern: The implementation plan policy and management aspects of the main production and marketing benefit, production of the estate has been conducted not sideline Justice against people as farmers economic empowerment programs in psychology. The reality of research findings highlighted the marginalization in which access occurs where people as participants in the economic empowerment of people's farmers failed to get palm oil processing plant as contained in the agreement between the contract giver program (Government) with the people as farmers populist economic empowerment program participants, so that the people as a program participant farmers have no access to the main production and marketing expediency, sideline production results of plantations.

Inkonsistensi of the contents of the contractual agreements is an unfair treatment, as according to the view of the flow of legal positivism justice embodied in the certainty in law, ethics, politics, economics and science of law. In this connection the people as farmers increasingly away from program participants the factors of production and benefit in achieving prosperity.

Likewise with the injustice that happened to the people as a self help farmers, who have no power economically to build palm oil processing plant. So from the above it can be concluded that the blurb on the side of policy, which govern aspects of the expediency of the main production and marketing and processing sideline production results between the plantation oil palm Mills with suppliers of oil palm Fruit (people as farmers oil palm planters) neither of which actually belonged to the populist Economic Empowerment program participants as well as the people as farmers on the pattern of Self-help has maintained its position in not equitable.

Policy implications and management aspects of the production and marketing of expediency: Policy implications and management among other things: i. on a segment of the plan and the implementation of policies and the management segment of the gardening aspect of the production and marketing of the results benefit the more affirming the existence of marginalization, monopoly and dominance of State plantation companies as well as private plantation companies to people on all the existing development pattern, in gaining added value through the application of the system and the effort of agribusiness plantations, as well as on the guarantee in the law No 18/2004 part one, article 27; ii. the people's Position on all the above estates development patterns, increasingly isolated from the aspects of production and marketing expediency of

plantations for the contribution of palm groves as farmers selling bunches of fresh fruit to the processing plant of the company's core plantation, on the existing policies are ignored as law No 18/2004 on plantations, the second section of chapter v marketing results of plantations, which are not set on the expediency of the main production and marketing results sideline production, plantations. Iii. Policy and management aspects of the benefit and the primary product marketing, production of the estate on a sideline pattern of populist economic empowerment and self-help patterns since the implementation of the plan until segemen policy and management are increasingly distancing people from leaving aside specialized factors of production and people from the road to prosperity in the plantations.

The reconstruction of Injustice: Reconstruction policies and management on the expediency of the main production and marketing, production of the estate's side i. strengthening of the rights of a subject/estate against marginalization in the access, control and benefits through the mastery of important asset by the people, namely asset production processing results of the plantation; ii. reduction of the dominant power, namely the reduction of dominance (power/authority) Government on corporate management alignments plantation estates private companies and State of resource processing plant, the economies of scale of plantation, plantation policy politics; Strengthening economic democracy against monopoly and iv. Strengthening of the obligations of Government to the people's welfare and prosperity of the planters.

Conclusion

Such a policy and management aspects of the expediency of the main production and marketing, the production side of plantation estates subject to the pattern of development was conducted of inequity on a segment of the substance of policy and plan on the implementation of the policy.

Injustice on the substance of the policy plan is in the form of policy or lack of regulation as the cornerstone of the implementation of the benefit aspect of the main production and marketing, the production side of plantation estates for the subject; The People.

While injustice in implementation of policy is the occurrence of marginalization on access, on the controls and on the merits; monopoly on typical resources, economies of scale, political/business policy; and domination on; magnitud powernya.

References

1. Soetrisno Loekman, Masalah dan prospek PIR-BUN. *Prisma XXVIII*, 4, 65-72 (1989)
2. Arief Sritua, Ekonomi Kerakyatan Indonesia; mengenang Bung Hatta Bapak Ekonomi Kerakyatan Indonesia,

- Surakarta: UMS, (2002)
3. Gunawan Rimbo and Juni Thamrin dan Mies Grijns, Dilema Petani Plasma, Pengalaman, PIR-BUN Jawa Barat, Bandung, Akatiga, (1995)
 4. Chotim E. Ermawati, Disharmoni inti-Plasma dalam Pola PIR: Kasus PIR Pangan pada Agroindustri Nanas di Subang, Bandung : Akatiga, (1996)
 5. Fadjar Undang, Perubahan struktur yang belum lengkap dalam kemitraan usaha perkebunan, *Forum Penelitian Agro Ekonomi*, **24(1)**, 46-60 (2006)
 6. Syarfi Ira Wahyuni, Pembangunan Perkebunan Rakyat di Sumatera Barat: (Suatu Kajian dalam perspektif Pembangunan ekonomi Kerakyatan) *Disertasi Program Doktor. Ilmu Pertanian, Pemusatan Pembangunan Pertanian, Universitas Andalas Padang*, (2007)
 7. Tjondronegoro S.M.P, Sosiologi Agraria: Kumpulan Tulisan terpilih Bandung: Akatiga, (1999)
 8. Goldsmith A, The perspective sektor and rural development: Can agribusiness help the small farmer?, *World Development*, **12(10/11)**, 1125-1128 (1985)
 9. Fauzi Noer, Land reform sebagai Variabel Sosial: Perkiraan tentang Rintangan Politik dan Finansial Pelaksanaan Land Reform. *Seminar "mengkaji Kembali Land Reform d Indonesia*, Jakarta, BPN, Land Law Initiative (LLI) dan Rural Development Institute (RDI), (2002)
 10. Sunarko, Budidaya dan Pengolahan Kebun Kelapa Sawit Dengan Sistem Kemitraan. Jakarta. Agromedia Pustaka, (2009)
 11. Gunawan Wiradi, Pola penguasaan Tanah dan reforma Agraria", (dalam Sudiono.M.P. Tjondronegoro and dan Gunawan, Wiradi-Eds., *Dua Abad penguasaan Tanah, Pola Penguasaan Tanah Pertanian di Jawa dari masa-ke masa*), Jakarta: Gramedia untuk Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 291, (1984)
 12. Scott James C, Moral Ekonomi Petani, Jakarta, LP3ES, (1983)
 13. Duffy K, Social Exclusion and Human Dignity in Europe, Strasbourg: Council of Europe, (1995)
 14. Dwitho Frasetiandy, Menakar dampak sosial perkebunan sawit, <http://www.walhikalsel.org/content/view/131/48/> [Diakses 2013/2/07], (2009)
 15. Soesastro Hadi, Microeconomic Policy Reform : Strategy for Regional Cooperation, *EABER Working Papers 21856, East Asian Bureau of Economic Research*, (2007)
 16. Graham E, Dan I. Floering, The modern plantation in the third world, London: Croom Helm, (1984)
 17. Kartasmita Ginanjar Dkk, Perubahan dan Pembangunan, Ikatan Alumni ITB, (2005)
 18. Fadjar Undang, Pengembangan Pola Kemitraan Agribisnis Perkebunan: Studi Perbandingan pada Petani Karet PIR-BUN-UPP dan Non Proyek, *Prosiding Lokakarya Kemitraan Pertanian*, Bogor: APPI, (2000)
 19. Rawls Jhon, A Theory of Justice, London: Oxford University press, 1973, yang sudah diterjemahkan dalam bahasa Indonesia oleh Uzair Fauzan dan Heru Prasetyo, *Teori Keadilan*, Yogyakarta, Pustaka Pelajar, (2006)
 20. Dillon H.S, Keadilan Prasyarat Kelestarian, *Jakarta: Jurnal Nasional*, (2013)
 21. Pangabean Godlim, Perkebunan, Masa Lalu, Masa Kini, dan Masa Datang. Tabloid Sinar Tani. Edisi 22- 28 Desember 2011 No. 3385 Tahun XLI, (2011)